

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING AGENDA		
1:00 PM	MARCH 14, 2023	ASPEN ROOM AND TEAMS (EMAIL CIVILSERVICE@AURORAGOV.ORG FOR LINK)
1) 1:00 PM CALL TO ORDER OF REGULAR MEETING		
A. Adoption of Agenda		
B. Approval of Minutes for February 14, February 28, and March 6, 2023		
2) AGENDA ITEMS FOR VOTE-None		
3) AGENDA ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION or POSSIBLE VOTE		
A. Consent Decree Monitor Comparison of Hiring Proposals		IntegrAssure
4) REPORTS		
A. COMMISSIONER REPORTS		
B. LEGAL COUNSEL REPORTS		
5) COMMENTS		
A. FIRE DEPARTMENT		
• Chief or Designee		
• Union Designee		
B. POLICE DEPARTMENT		
• Chief or Designee		
• Association Designee		
➤ APA		
➤ FOP		
C. CITY MANAGER DEPARTMENT		
D. PUBLIC COMMENT – Limited to 3 minutes, no discussion *Please note: The Commission cannot consider or respond to any comments that relate in any manner to disciplinary appeals currently pending before the Commission.		
6) ADJOURNMENT		

1 - 7a

IntegrAssure Proposal

- 1 Candidates are recruited by AFR. Mentors are assigned to each candidate
- 2 Candidates fill out job interest cards which are entered int Applicant Tracking System (ATS)
- 3 CSC publishes online job announcement with dates for receipts of applications
- 4 Candidates complete application on line.
- 5 CSC screens applications to ensure minimum qualifications are met.
- 6 Candidates complete written test
- 7 CSC applies preference points and establishes preliminary ranking

City Proposal

- 1 Candidates are recruited by AFR. Mentors are assigned to each candidate
- 2 Candidates fill out job interest cards which are entered Int Applicant Tracking System (ATS)
- 3 CSC publishes online job announcement with dates for receipts of applications
- 4 Candidates complete application on line.
- 5 CSC screens applications to ensure minimum qualifications are met.
- 6 Candidates complete written test
- 7 CSC applies preference points and establishes final ranking
- CSC certifies list of applicants who successfully met minimum quals and passed the examination

IAFF Proposal

- 1 Candidates are recruited by AFR. Mentors are assigned to each candidate
- 2 Candidates fill out job interest cards which are entered int Applicant Tracking System (ATS)
- 3 CSC publishes online job announcement with dates for receipts of applications
- 4 Candidates complete application on line.
- 5 CSC screens applications to ensure minimum qualifications are met.
- 6 Candidates complete written test
- 7 CSC applies preference points and establishes preliminary ranking

	Comment on Proposal as Expert on IAFF's Proposal	Analysis of Proposal as Monitor on IAFF's Proposal	Potential Resolution of Issue
1	Same. We agree.	Meets CD mandate.	
2	Same. We agree. (ATS should be maintained by HR.)	Meets CD mandate.	
3	Same. We agree (but must be driven by AFR/HR on the content)	Meets CD mandate.	
4	Same. We agree.	Meets CD mandate.	
5	Same. We agree.	Meets CD mandate.	
6	Same. We agree.	Meets CD mandate.	
7	Same. We agree.	Meets CD mandate.	

Comment on Proposal as Expert on City's Proposal

Analysis of Proposal as Monitor on City's Proposal

- | | | |
|---|--|-------------------|
| 1 | Same. We agree. | Meets CD mandate. |
| 2 | Same. We agree. (ATS should be maintained by HR.) | Meets CD mandate. |
| 3 | Same. We agree (but must be driven by AFR/HR on the content) | Meets CD mandate. |
| 4 | Same. We agree. | Meets CD mandate. |
| 5 | Same. We agree. | Meets CD mandate. |
| 6 | Same. We agree. | Meets CD mandate. |

We understand the City's proposal is to mirror the current process. We recommend that the ranking should occur after the oral interviews pursuant to a rubric to score the oral interviews. The rubric should be developed collaboratively by HR, AFR, and CSC. We recommend a fully ranked order list, combining written exam score and oral interview score, as opposed to two tiers being established and that rule of six be applied at the end of the process with the composition of 3 AFR representatives and 2 CSC reps.

Meets CD mandate.

7a

Please see above comment for step 7.

Meets CD mandate

8-11

IntegrAssure

8

Candidates complete Personal History Statement

9

Job Suitability Assessment Report provided to Background Investigator

10

Background investigation with deficits

11

File Review to determine if candidate should proceed under "Whole Person" analysis

City

Candidates complete Personal History Statement

Job Suitability Assessment Report provided to Background Investigator. AFR and HR will promulgate and publish standards.

Background investigation with deficits. HR and AFR will promulgate and publish standards.

File Review to determine if candidate should proceed under "Whole Person" analysis. Department conducts review of all candidate files. Written results of department's review are provided to CSC for separate file review. CSC may flag any decision for reconsideration.

IAFF

Candidates complete Personal History Statement

Job Suitability Assessment Report provided to Background Investigator

Background investigation with deficits

File Review to determine if candidate should proceed under "Whole Person" analysis

Expert on IAFF

Monitor on IAFF

Potential resolution

8 Same. We agree.

Meets CD mandate.

9 In both cases the JSA will be completed by an outside vendor and supplied to the Background Investigator. There is a question as to whether the Background Investigators will be under the aegis of CSC or HR (See Below)

Meets CD mandate.

10 In both cases the background investigation will be completed by retained or employed investigators. There is a question as to whether the Background Investigators will be under the aegis of CSC or HR (See Below)

Meets CD mandate.

11 In both cases a file review would be conducted. IAFF proposes that it be done with one rep from AFR. We have proposed that it be done with 2 CSC members and 3 AFR members.

The IntegrAssure proposal meets the CD mandate, the IAFF proposal does not as it would provide CSC with the final decision as to whether that particular candidate should be hired or not.

Adopt the membership for this task as for oral interview.

Expert on City

Monitor on City

Potential
Resolution

8 Same. We agree.

Meets CD mandate.

9 In both cases the JSA will be completed by an outside vendor and supplied to the Background Investigator. There is a question as to whether the Background Investigators will be under the aegis of CSC or HR (See Below) but as recommended in the Hiring Report, the standards should be promulgated with HR, agency, and CSC.

Meets CD mandate.

10 In both cases the background investigation will be completed by retained or employed investigators. There is a question as to whether the Background Investigators will be under the aegis of CSC or HR (See Below)

Meets CD mandate.

11 The City proposes a separate panel for AFR and CSC and then a collaborative discussion if disagreements. We have proposed that it be done with 2 CSC members and 3 AFR members. We think it may be more efficient with one panel with the membership as proposed.

Meets CD mandate as even if disagreement, the department will have a final say.

12-14

IntegrAssure

City

I AFF

12

CSC receives all files and administers the Oral Interview with the assistance of HR. Interview with 3 AFR reps, 2 CSC reps, and one Community rep selected by the CSC. Tie vote would be broken by an HR observer.

HR receives all files and administers the Oral Interview. Panel is 3 department reps, and 2 community reps determined by the CSC.

HR receives all files and administers the Oral Interview with 3 AFR reps and 3 CSC reps to decide whether the candidate receives a conditional job offer. Tie vote means applicant passes.

13

CSC certifies a ranked list of applicants based on a combined test and oral score

14

Conditional offer made based on the number of seats available in the academy and account for candidates fail subsequent tests or withdraw from the process.

Conditional offers made.

Conditional offers made to passing applicants from step #12 to fill academy. Alternates identified and fill Academy spots if any passing applicants decline the job offer.

15

Psychological Evaluation

Psychological Evaluation provided by external vendor to HR. AFR and HR promulgate and publish standards.

Psychological Evaluation provided by external vendor to HR

16

Medical Examination

Medical examination provided by external vendor to HR. AFR and HR promulgate and publish standards.

Medical examination provided by external vendor to HR

Expert on IAFF

Monitor on IAFF

Potential Resolution

12 We believe that having HR receive the files and administer the interview is a good thing and an improvement on the IntegrAssure proposal. With regard to the composition of the panel, IntegrAssure recommended that it be comprised of 2 CSC members, 3 AFR members and a member of the Community chosen by the CSC. We still believe that this is best. IntegrAssure recommended that in the case of a tie the tie would be broken by an HR observer.

The IntegrAssure proposal meets the CD mandate, the IAFF proposal meets the CD mandate relative to the HR receiving the file and the composition of the panel, but does not meet the mandate of the CD because a candidate would be passed on irrespective of the majority of AFR votes, thereby depriving AFR of the final say on a candidate.

For the IAFF proposal a tie would have to yield to the plurality of agency representatives.

13 As noted above, IntegrAssures recommendation is for a ranked list to be established. Without a ranked list we do not see how candidates can be selected and then filled in.

Meets CD mandate.

14 We believe that having HR handle this part of the process is a good thing. If there are more candidates than there are seats, the IAFF proposal without an apparent ranking does not work.

Without ranking the candidates the proposal does not provide adequate safeguards to ensure that a quality diverse workforce would be hired and that AFR would have the final say.

Rank the candidates.

15 We agree that this should be an external vendor reporting the findings to HR

Meets CD mandate.

16 We agree that this should be an external vendor reporting the findings to HR

Meets CD mandate.

Expert on City

Monitor on City

Potential Resolution

- | | | |
|----|--|-------------------|
| | <p>We believe that having HR receive the files and administer the interview is a good thing and an improvement on the IntegrAssure proposal.</p> | |
| | <p>With regard to the composition of the panel, IntegrAssure recommended that it be comprised of 2 CSC members, 3 AFR members and a member of the Community chosen by the CSC.</p> | |
| 12 | <p>We believe CSC members and the community member will bring forth diverse thoughts and perspectives to the discussion. There was also a discussion on 2/27 CSC meeting of 3 AFR reps and 3 CSC reps and if a tie, being determined by AFR. We believe this composition may work better than the City's proposal.</p> | Meets CD Mandate |
| | <p>We believe the ranking is more appropriate at this juncture of the hiring process. Oral</p> | |
| 13 | <p>interviews will be scored pursuant to a rubric, which should be developed collaboratively by HR, AFR, and CSC.</p> | N/A |
| | <p>We believe that having HR handle this part of the process is a good thing.</p> | Meets CD Mandate |
| 15 | <p>Same, we agree.</p> | Meets CD mandate. |
| 16 | <p>Same, we agree.</p> | Meets CD mandate. |

17 - 20

IntegrAssure

City

IAFF

17

Substance Abuse Screening

Substance Abuse screening provided by external vendor to HR. AFR and HR promulgate and publish standards.

Substance Abuse screening provided by external vendor to HR

18

CPAT Physical Fitness Test

CPAT test certification provided by external applicant to HR. AFR and HR will promulgate and publish standards.

CPAT test certification provided by external applicant to HR

19

Application of Rule of Six. HR will compile the results into a final applicant file which will be presented to the agency for final review. 3 AFR and 2 CSC will review and the panel will vote on which of the top six candidates should be selected for each available seat in the Academy.

HR will compile the results into a final applicant file which will be presented to AFR for final review. Written results of department's review are provided to CSC for separate file review. CSC may flag any decision for reconsideration. Offers will be made in order of certified list provided by CSC in step 7a.

20

Final job offer

Final job offer

Final job offer

Additional Items

Expert on IAFF

Monitor on IAFF

Potential Resolution

17 We agree that this should be an external vendor reporting the findings to HR

Meets CD mandate.

18 We agree that certification of passing should be provided by the applicant to HR

Meets CD mandate.

19 IntegrAssure's recommendation is for a ranked list to be established. Without a ranked list we do not see how candidates can be selected and then filled in. The rule of six provides the ability to chose among the next six people on the list for each available spot. The choice would be a shared responsibility between the two CSC reps and the 3 AFR reps, as reflected in the next box.

Without ranking the candidates the proposal does not provide adequate safeguards to ensure that a quality diverse workforce would be hired and that AFR would have the final say.

20 We assume this step was left out unintentionally in the proposal.

Meets CD mandate.

Additional Items

Expert on City

Monitor on City

Potential Resolution

17 Same, we agree.

Meets CD mandate.

18 Same, we agree.

Meets CD mandate.

The City proposes a separate panel for CSC and AFR and then a collaborative discussion if disagreements. We have proposed that it be done with 2 CSC members and 3 AFR members. We think it may be more efficient with one panel with the membership as proposed. In addition, we believe the ranking should be established with the combined score of the written exam and the oral interview. We believe the better way to rank is the way IntegrAssure has recommended, which is to have a ranking of combined score of the written exam and oral interview and to use Rule of Six.

19

Meets CD Mandate.

20 Same, we agree.

Meets CD mandate.

Ad
diti
on
al
Ite
ms

A - D

Integr ASSure

City

IAFF

A Between steps 2 and 3: HR responsible for on-going examination of potential disparate impacts of minimum quals, and ensuring that data is retained to allow for fulsome examination of data. HR will examine job announcements, make sure physical fitness requirements are posted, work with stakeholders on PHS, and ensuring consistency of AFR and APD processes and where possible with the rest of the City.

Between steps 2 and 3: HR responsible for on-going examination of potential disparate impacts of minimum quals, and ensuring that data is retained to allow for fulsome examination of data. HR will examine job announcements, make sure physical fitness requirements are posted, work with stakeholders on PHS, and ensuring consistency of AFR and APD processes and where possible with the rest of the City.

Not addressed.

B Between 5 and 6: Collaboration between HR, CSC and agency to select written exam vendor and minimum cut off score. HR will coordinate.

Between 5 and 6: Collaboration between HR, CSC and agency to select written exam vendor and minimum cut off score. HR will coordinate.

Not addressed.

C Between 6 and 7: HR will coordinate the review of discretionary preference points by the stakeholders to ensure that the goals of the CD are met.

Between 6 and 7: HR will coordinate the review of discretionary preference points by the stakeholders to ensure that the goals of the CD are met.

Not addressed.

D Between 7 and 8: HR will coordinate with the stakeholders to determine the written guidelines and standards for the content and submission of PHS. Physical fitness requirements to be sent to candidates.

Between 7 and 8: HR will coordinate with the stakeholders to determine the written guidelines and standards for the content and submission of PHS. Physical fitness requirements to be sent to candidates.

Not addressed.

Expert on IAFF

Monitor on IAFF

This is within the expertise of HR to ensure consistency across all of the City's workforce. This

- A addresses CD's mandate to transform the hiring process to ensure qualified and diverse workforce for APD and AFR.

Will not meet CD mandate without this.

This is within HR's expertise and this meets the CD mandate for APD/AFR to have a far more active role with assistance and coordination from HR.

- B

Will not meet CD mandate without this.

This is within the expertise of HR to ensure consistency across all of the City's workforce. This

- C addresses CD's mandate to transform the hiring process to ensure qualified and diverse workforce for APD and AFR.

Will not meet CD mandate without this.

This is within HR's expertise and this meets the CD mandate for APD/AFR to have a far more active role with assistance and coordination from HR as well as transforming hiring process to ensure qualified and diverse workforce for APD and AFR.

- D

Will not meet CD mandate without this.

Expert on city

monitor on city

A

Same, we agree.

Meets CD mandate

B

Same, we agree.

Meets CD Mandate.

C

Same, we agree.

Meets CD Mandate.

D

Same, we agree.

Meets CD Mandate

E-H

IntegrAssure

City

IAFF

E

Between 8 and 9: With respect to the Job Suitability Assessment (JSA), HR will coordinate with the agencies and CSC any change of vendors for the JSA.

Between 8 and 9: With respect to the Job Suitability Assessment (JSA), HR will coordinate with the agencies and CSC any change of vendors for the JSA.

Not addressed.

F

Between 8 and 9: HR will oversee the administration of background investigations in collaboration with the agencies and CSC.

Between 8 and 9: HR will oversee the administration of background investigations in collaboration with the agencies and CSC.

Between 8 and 9: CSC will oversee the administration of background investigations.

G

Happening concurrently with 11: HR will develop a written matrix of evaluative criteria to conduct a file review.

Happening concurrently with 11: HR will develop a written matrix of evaluative criteria to conduct a file review.

Not addressed

H

Happening concurrently with 11: DQ'd applicants can appeal to CSC.

Happening concurrently with 11: DQ'd applicants can appeal to CSC.

Not addressed.

EXTRA ON IAFF

E This is within HR's expertise and this meets the CD mandate for APD/AFR to have a far more active role with assistance and coordination from HR.

F We believe IntegrAssure's recommendation will provide for uniformity of background investigations within the city (although special aspects of investigations can exist for each uniformed force). We also believe this will provide appropriate supervision and accountability for investigators as well as quality control over investigations. Similar to all external vendors, having this aspect report to HR ensures consistency of the process.

G This is within HR's expertise and this meets the CD mandate for APD/AFR to have a far more active role with assistance and coordination from HR.

H The recommended process is designed to provide proper checks and balances and also strengthens CSC's role as the appellate body to provide a candidate with a second look to ensure the impartiality and fairness of the process by the Commission, a role no other entity in the City can play. Thus, APD and AFR will be held accountable by CSC for the decisions they make in the process.

Monitor on IAFF

Will not meet CD mandate without this.

Meets CD Mandate.

Will need this to meet the CD mandate.

Not needed by CD.

~~Monitor~~
Expert on city

Monitor on city

E Same, we agree.

Meets CD Mandate

F Same, we agree.

Meets CD Mandate

G Same, we agree.

Meets CD Mandate.

H Same, we agree.

Meets CD Mandate

I - J

IntegrAssure

City

IAA

I

Happening concurrently with 12: All panelists will receive standardized training and structured interview questions developed by HR with collaboration from CSC and agency. HR will conduct disparate impact analysis. HR will then rank by combined scores of the interview, written exam, and preference points. CSC will certify that list.

Happening concurrently with 12: All panelists will receive standardized training and structured interview questions developed by HR with collaboration from CSC and agency. HR will conduct disparate impact analysis. HR will then rank by combined scores of the interview, written exam, and preference points. CSC will certify that list.

Not addressed.

J

Happening concurrently with 14: Applicants who did not receive conditional offer can appeal to CSC.

Happening concurrently with 14: Applicants who did not receive conditional offer can appeal to CSC.

Not addressed.

Expert on IAFF

monitor on IAFF

I This is within the expertise of HR to ensure consistency across all of the City's workforce. This addresses CD's mandate to transform the hiring process to ensure qualified and diverse workforce for APD and AFR.

Will need this to meet CD mandate.

J The recommended process is designed to provide proper checks and balances and also strengthens CSC's role as the appellate body to provide a candidate with a second look to ensure the impartiality and fairness of the process by the Commission, a role no other entity in the City can play. Thus, APD and AFR will be held accountable by CSC for the decisions they make in the process.

Not needed by CD.

Expert on City

Monitor on City

I

Same, we agree.

Meets CD Mandate

J

Same, we agree.

Meets CD Mandate.